

## **RESEARCHING WOMEN IN SCOTLAND: PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES**

*Alice Brown, Fiona Myers and Esther Breitenbach*

### **INTRODUCTION**

For anyone conducting research on women in Scotland, a major problem is the relative lack of attention which has been given in the past to studying gender relations in Scotland. This situation is improving with the publication in recent years of works focusing on the history of women's lives in Scotland (Breitenbach and Gordon 1992; Gordon and Breitenbach 1990; King 1992; and Leneman 1991), on women in Scottish politics (Brown 1991; Brown and Galligan 1993; Levy 1992), and on gender and education in Scotland (Bamford 1988; Brown 1993; Brown and Riddell 1992). Nevertheless, there are key areas of women's economic, political and social experience which remain largely under-researched.

This article reports the results of a Research Review which the authors carried out for the Equal Opportunities Commission (EOC) in Scotland on

---

*Alice Brown is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Politics at the University of Edinburgh, and is an Assistant Editor of **Scottish Affairs**. Fiona Myers is a Research Fellow in the Social Work Research Centre at the University of Stirling. Esther Breitenbach is a Research Fellow in the Department of Social Policy and Social Work at the University of Glasgow. The authors have researched and published articles and books on women in Scotland. Alice Brown and Esther Breitenbach were on the first Board of Directors of the new women's organisation, Engender. The authors wish to acknowledge the financial support given by the Equal Opportunities Commission to funding the research review on women in Scotland. The views expressed in this article are those of the authors alone. The Research Review discussed here, **Equality Issues in Scotland: A Research Review**, can be obtained from: Equal Opportunities Commission, Stock Exchange House, 7 Nelson Mandela Place, Glasgow, G2 1QW, Tel: 041.248.5833, Price: £10.95*

### *Scottish Affairs*

equality issues in Scotland (Brown, Breitenbach and Myers 1994). Although the review does not cover all areas of research of relevance to women, it does provide a comprehensive overview of the research which has been conducted on women and girls in Scotland across a wide range of topics. We were able to build on a previous review of research on education (Bamford 1988), a bibliography of research produced by the Women in Scotland Bibliography Group (1988), and a Gender Audit published by Engender (1993).

In the first part of the article, we outline the main findings of our review of research. We then summarise some of the future developments which are likely to have a direct impact on the lives of women in Scotland and which could provide the focus for future research.

The object of the review was to collate information on the type and extent of research which has been conducted and to identify major gaps in our knowledge, so that potential research funding could be directed more effectively in the future. Conducting the review confirmed our impression that, notwithstanding the practical difficulties involved in identifying relevant studies, there are serious limitations in the scope and depth of research on women in Scotland.

In our conclusions we discuss some of the difficulties for researchers, especially those interested in issues of gender within Scotland. We argue that there are specific barriers and obstacles to seeking funding and to researching in such areas. Finally, we explore the question of whether the lack of research funding on women matters, and ask whether the situation would be improved if researchers were operating within a different institutional and constitutional framework in Scotland.

### **THE PROJECT**

The project was funded for four months. Given the short time scale, it was decided to limit the review to publications from 1975 onwards, 1975 being the date of the full implementation of the Equal Pay Act and the Sex Discrimination Act, and the creation of the EOC. The primary object of the work was to examine the experience of women and girls in Scotland within the EOC's areas of interest, namely access to justice for individuals; women's economic independence, especially in respect of pay, part-time work, pensions and social security; equal treatment in education; equal access to work; equal treatment at work; consumer affairs; multiple discrimination; and regional differences. These parameters, together with the limited time scale,

### *Researching Women in Scotland*

meant that it was not possible to survey all studies in Scotland which may include gender as one of the variables to be analysed, or gender-related research work in the UK which may include Scottish data.

Material for the review was collected by three main methods. First there was a literature search drawing on a number of sources. This was supplemented by a questionnaire survey of academics and researchers known to be working on topics relevant to the review, and a telephone survey of other individuals and organisations in Scotland, who could potentially have an interest in gender-related research. In total over 70 academics returned completed questionnaires, and some 130 individuals and organisations participated in the telephone survey.

We encountered a number of problems in trying to identify work on women in Scotland. Although some studies have implications for women, the gender dimension is often neglected. Second, some work has a gender dimension, but this is just one of the variables under examination. A further problem exists in studies which collect data almost exclusively from women, such as information from primary school teachers, but where the study is not identified as a study of women teachers. Similar difficulties arise in respect of the Scottish context, where UK studies have implications for Scotland but are not analysed by country. These issues extend to UK-wide and GB-wide data sets which do not provide a breakdown by country, region or sex. As a result, using words such as 'women', 'gender', or 'Scotland' may fail to unearth all the important studies which are sensitive to gender, and aware of the specific Scottish dimension of the findings. Although posing practical problems, these issues arising from the way studies are catalogued and classified also reflect how research is perceived and presented by researchers themselves, and the way in which academics communicate their work to the wider community.

### **ANALYSIS OF THE LITERATURE**

The authors were not surprised to find that the majority of studies and research sources related to the fields of employment and education. The first perhaps reflects the increasing interest in women's participation in the economy. In the case of education, the reason may lie in the distinct nature of the education system in Scotland and the institutional role which the Scottish Office Education Department has within the Scottish Office in determining educational policy.

### *Scottish Affairs*

There are a number of general factors which emerged from our review which applied to most of the topics which we studied. For example, as we have stated, the research which is available is limited in scope and depth, and in some areas, such as multiple discrimination, is virtually non-existent. There are few published books, few major studies and an almost total absence of research which moves beyond the purely descriptive. Many studies which have been carried out are small-scale and local, and do not attempt to monitor change over time or to compare the experience of women within Scotland or between Scotland and other parts of Britain. The research which is available has been produced mainly for specialist audiences, and dissemination of the results to the wider community is poor. As a result, it is very difficult to provide an overview or comprehensive picture of the position of women in Scottish society.

This pattern is illustrated in relation to the research undertaken specifically in the EOC's areas of interest.

#### ***Equal Access to Work***

Although the introduction of the Equal Pay and Sex Discrimination Acts in the mid 1970s generated interest in researching women's employment, this research activity was not sustained in the following decade. The late 1980s and early 1990s have witnessed something of a revival, the impetus for which appears to have come from the so-called 'demographic timebomb' - the expected labour shortages as fewer young workers were available to enter the labour market. As a result it could be argued that the interest in equal opportunity and in encouraging more women to return to the workforce during this period was stimulated by economic necessity rather than on moral, social or political grounds.

A key focus for surveys in this field are the barriers faced by women in returning to the labour market, with particular attention being given to examining the provision of childcare. Lack of acceptable and affordable childcare is highlighted in research studies, as is the lack of information on training and education and the costs of such opportunities, an insufficient number of attractive jobs, lack of flexible working arrangements, lack of flexibility in the organisation and delivery of training and education, poor physical access and poor availability of transport, and attitudes of employers as well as partners, family and friends.

We found very few studies which explored issues of multiple discrimination such as age, ethnicity, disability or sexual orientation. Although women's

### *Researching Women in Scotland*

employment is an area which receives attention in research terms, there is no published work in book form which gives an overview of women's employment in Scotland and which compares the experience of women in different parts of Scotland or their experience in relation to women in other parts of Britain. Most studies are concerned with a particular region or locality.

#### ***Equal treatment at work***

Statistics which are available on women in employment in Scotland suggest that they are segregated in particular occupational sectors and at the lower levels of the career hierarchy. The majority of women work in low paid, low grade jobs, in the service sector of the economy. Over half of working women are married, over forty per cent of women work part-time, and on average women's pay is just over two-thirds that of men's (Engender 1994).

Just as barriers for women wishing to enter the workplace have been given some research attention, the barriers faced by women at work in terms of promotion have also been studied. The majority of studies have been conducted comparatively recently, and focus in particular on the problem of women's failure to reach senior positions in organisations - the so-called 'glass ceiling'. It is this area which has resulted in one of the few published books on women in Scotland (Gerver and Hart 1991).

In contrast to the work conducted on women's promotion, the pay and conditions of women at work have not received so much research attention, and the implications of part-time work with respect to women's access to training and employment rights have been largely overlooked. Interestingly, in spite of the reported incidence of sexual harassment at work, and the level of concern expressed by women, this problem has also not attracted a substantial degree of research.

#### ***Equal treatment in education***

Unlike a number of the other topics covered in our study, education has been the subject of research, and a comprehensive review of published and unpublished research on gender issues in education in Scotland was completed in 1988. It was written by Caroline Bamford who identified major limitations and gaps in the available research (Bamford 1988). She commented that many of the studies she found were small-scale, and that some areas of interest had not been researched at all. Also very little was known about the inter-relationship of gender with other variables, such as

### *Scottish Affairs*

class and ethnicity. As we have discussed above under our general findings, these are conclusions which are not specific to research on gender issues in education.

Since the publication of Caroline Bamford's review in 1988, there has been no major change in the pattern of research, although it would appear that there is a growing awareness amongst researchers in this field that gender and other variables require more detailed investigation. Also, as the article by Professor Sally Brown in a previous edition of *Scottish Affairs* states, most of the research which is available on gender and education is descriptive and prone to 'monitoring bleakness' (Brown 1993). Sally Brown argues for the need to provide an explanation for gender differences, and to develop a theoretical understanding.

Statistics are collected and analysed on gender differences in examination performance and staying on rates at secondary school, on participation in further and higher education, and on subject segregation. These show that girls achieve higher levels of examination qualifications than boys and are less likely to leave school early. Nevertheless, a smaller proportion of girls with the necessary qualifications go to university as compared with boys. The complex reasons for gender differences in subject presentations and attainments are still relatively under-researched, and there is little qualitative research on the educational experiences of girls and boys.

Some studies have examined gender differences in participation in the curriculum, and the academic performance of secondary school children in relation to class and gender. From the perspective of the teacher rather than the pupil, it is recognised that women's position in the teaching profession is an unequal one. Work has, therefore, been undertaken on the promotion of teachers, equal opportunities policies, and teachers' reasons for leaving the profession. Mirroring the attention given to women's entry to the labour market, some studies are available on women's access to higher education and women's participation in adult education in Scotland.

#### ***Access to Justice***

The term 'access to justice' could be interpreted in many different ways. In restricting the definition as relating primarily to means of redress in the field of employment and the operation of the Equal Pay and Sex Discrimination Acts in Scotland, the authors found only one study (Marshall and Aldred 1977). There is some evidence from a study of the tribunal system in Britain carried out by Alice Leonard that applicants in Scotland receive

### *Researching Women in Scotland*

compensation quicker than applicants in England and Wales (Leonard 1987). Further, there is a belief that Scottish tribunals hear cases more quickly than tribunals in England and Wales. However, there has been no comparative study of the operation of the system, and the reasons for the apparent differences are, therefore, not fully understood.

Widening the definition of 'access to justice', the review identified a study on access to social security tribunals in Scotland (Kay 1984) and another on access to justice for people from ethnic minorities (Ross 1993). We were unable to find material on the access to justice for women with disabilities, or on the impact of sexual orientation on equality of access to employment.

Broadening the interpretation even further, the review identified a number of studies which look at women's experience of domestic violence and the service response which they receive. Common themes of the studies which have been completed are the lack of awareness among women of their rights, and the variable response of support agencies which women approach for help.

Finally in relation to the operation of the criminal justice system, studies are not necessarily gender-specific. Evidence would suggest, however, that in areas where women are the main instigators of action against an offender, such as sexual offence trials, they may not be as well-served by the legislation as expected. Very little research has examined the experience of women within the Scottish criminal justice system as offenders. The work which is available suggests that gender differentiation in response and outcome exists.

#### ***Achieving Women's Economic Independence***

As research on women's employment, unemployment and pay indicate, women have difficulty in achieving economic independence because of their restricted access to highly paid and secure jobs in the labour market, and their predominance in low paid, low grade and part-time work. As in the field of education, statistical data is available, but there is a dearth of substantial studies which explore both the causes and the consequences involved.

In order to take a wider view of women's economic independence, the authors also examined research on benefits and social security, on issues of multiple discrimination, on housing and on the impact of divorce. We found no studies on the position of women in Scotland in relation to benefits and pensions. In spite of data which demonstrates regional differences in earnings and costs of transport, the high costs of disability and the relatively higher rates of

### *Scottish Affairs*

unemployment among women from ethnic minorities, there are no published studies examining these issues.

Women's access to housing is closely tied to the issue of economic independence. As one researcher, Ruth Madigan, has argued, women's economic dependence on men means that women are also often housing dependents, moving directly from parental home to marital home (Madigan 1983). We identified a small number of studies in this field which focus particularly on the housing consequences for women of marital breakdown and homelessness. Studies have explored the level of hidden homelessness amongst women. Housing for single parents was also a topic which had received some attention.

Another area which is significant to women's economic independence is financial settlements on divorce. The studies which we found in this area examine the impact of legal changes and the consequences of divorce for women

### ***Consumer Affairs***

Consumer affairs is an area which does not appear to have attracted research, despite the implications of access to credit and other consumer services for women's economic independence. The only study of women as consumers we found was a research project which considered women's access to cars.

### ***Areas of Multiple Discrimination***

In searching for materials in all the topics already discussed in our review, we were unable to find substantial pieces of research which focused on women with disabilities, older women, women from ethnic minorities, or women who are at risk of discrimination on the basis of their sexuality. We did identify a few, more general, studies relevant to these specific groups. Nevertheless it was our overall impression that issues of multiple discrimination have not been systematically addressed by research. Thus, if the experience of women as a group in Scotland has been under-researched, then women who may also experience an added level of discrimination because of their age, class, race, disability, sexuality or religion are further disadvantaged.

### ***Regional Differences***

The final area included in our study was regional differences within Scotland. It is recognised that the experience of women in different parts of Scotland

### *Researching Women in Scotland*

and within urban and rural communities may be substantially different. We were unable to find any studies which provided regional comparisons. Reflecting our general conclusions about local and small-scale studies, the studies which we identified tended to take a within-region rather than a between-regional approach. Some attempt has been made, however, to include within-region rural-urban comparisons. The causes and implications of regional differences specifically as they apply to women have yet to be researched.

### **FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS**

The main aim of our review was to summarise the research which had already been carried out on women in Scotland, and to identify gaps in our knowledge and understanding of equal opportunities issues. In considering the direction of potential research in the future, we also highlighted wider developments and government policies which may impact on men and women or on specific groups in Scottish society in a particular way. For example, structural changes in the economy and legislative changes could have a differential impact on men and women. In examining policies which could potentially have a negative effect on women in Scotland, we drew particular attention to labour market changes and local government reform.

First, there are several changes which are likely to affect the employment rights of women workers, and which could form the basis of future research. The decision by the government to abolish Wages Councils, which set minimum rates of pay in certain trades, is one illustration of a policy which will impact most directly on women. The majority of workers covered by minimum-pay protection were women and the effects of abolition will fall disproportionately on them. As women in Scotland already represent around 70 per cent of low paid workers, it is feared that women's pay relative to men's will deteriorate further, thus depriving women of economic independence, and contributing to their poverty. Statistics gathered by the Scottish Low Pay Unit indicate that wage rates have already fallen as a result of Wages Councils abolition.

In contrast, the recent judgement by the House of Lords that part-time workers are entitled to the same employment rights in relation to unfair dismissal and redundancy as full-time workers could have a positive effect on women's employment, as women form the majority of part-time workers in Scotland and the rest of Britain. Some commentators have cautioned that, paradoxically, this change could have a negative effect on women's

### *Scottish Affairs*

employment if it means that their labour is less attractive to employers because of the additional costs incurred in extending full-time workers' rights to part-time workers. Without research, the full impact of these labour market changes cannot be assessed.

Second, in the case of local government reform, the government proposes widespread re-organisation. Scotland is to have a new local government system from 1996 of around 33 unitary authorities, replacing the present two-tier structure of 53 District Councils, 9 Regional Councils and 3 Islands Councils. The government issued two Consultative Papers, the first stating its case for a unitary system and the second setting out alternative structures, before publishing a White Paper in 1993.

The possible impact of reform on women in Scotland did not feature in the consultation documents or in the White Paper, nor was it a factor which informed many of the responses to the government. However, reform is likely to impact on the lives of women in Scotland in a number of ways. At present women form a large percentage of workers in local government, and it is feared that they may lose out in re-organisation and any de-regulation policies which follow. Second, women's political representation at local government level at around 20 per cent is substantially higher than at the level of the House of Commons. There is a concern that this representation rate may fall when the number of councillors is reduced. Further, in general, women in the community rely more heavily on local government services than men, and it is expected that any cuts in services will disadvantage women disproportionately.

Specific services such as housing, education and social work have been subject to major changes even before local government re-organisation. The full impact of these changes is not fully understood. Examples of changes whose impact on women has yet to be assessed are: the reduction in the provision of public housing, women being far more dependent than men on this sector for housing; the increasing competition between schools for pupils and between pupils for places in further and higher education; and the implementation of community-care policy. The major re-organisation of local government which is proposed is thus likely to add another dimension to changing conditions for women.

## **CONCLUSIONS**

Women in Scotland still experience considerable inequality and disadvantage in economic, social and political terms as compared with men, and the progress towards equality has been slow. Evidence from our report would suggest that this disadvantage is compounded by the limited nature of research which has been carried out on women in Scotland. Further, it would appear that those women who are most disadvantaged or discriminated against in Scottish society suffer a further form of discrimination in their exclusion as a focus of research. The almost total absence of studies which attempt to provide an overview or framework creates problems for analysing the significance of smaller-scale studies, and in providing theoretical conclusions. Our impression is that Scotland is lagging behind other countries in this respect. These findings beg such questions as why is the research on women in Scotland so limited, does it matter and, if it does, what can be done about it?

The explanations for the relative lack of research on women in Scotland could range from the practical to the institutional and political. Also there are interesting ways in which different explanatory factors can inter-relate, and where, for example, the cause of a practical problem could have an institutional or political root. One possible explanation for the lack of substantial theory-based studies could be the practical difficulty in obtaining data which would form the basis for this type of work. Official statistical publications do not always provide data analysed by sex for Scotland, or for regions within Scotland. Furthermore, although British or UK data sets exist, they are not always fully utilised to provide information about women in Scotland. The problem here may be one of access to the material, or of the resources needed to conduct such data analysis. However, in itself this does not provide a sufficient answer to our original question, and leads to other questions surrounding the type of data which is collected and what is considered to be important or significant.

Another explanation could relate to the status attached to work which is conducted on women and which uses Scotland as a case study, and the difficulty in obtaining research funding in these fields. In carrying out our questionnaire and telephone survey, we found a considerable amount of interest amongst researchers and academics in researching gender issues in Scotland. Yet, it was notable that very few individuals appear to have been able to build up a body of work in an area related to women in Scotland, or gender-related research. This could be a consequence of the lack of consistent financial support for work of this kind, but it could also reflect the

### *Scottish Affairs*

gender-bias of academic recruitment and career structures, and the fact that the key funding bodies are dominated by male decision-makers. While it is not necessarily the case that research on gender and women is, or should be, carried out exclusively by women, this tends to be the case. However, since few women hold senior positions, they have little power within academic institutions (Engender 1993). Thus women's capacity to control the research agenda is limited, as is their capacity to challenge sexist bias in the content of courses, and the criteria on which recruitment and promotion should be based. For a woman wanting to make her way in an academic profession, choosing gender as her main research interest may not be a 'rational' choice if those people who make the decisions about academic promotion or awarding research grants do not value work of this nature.

The same point can be made about the 'Scottish' dimension where publication in Scottish Journals may not be rated as highly for assessment and promotion purposes as publications in British Journals, or where studies on Scotland are seen as peripheral and not academically significant. Further, publishers are often reluctant to publish work on Scotland in article or book form, on the grounds that it will not attract a large enough market. This creates a form of double jeopardy for a researcher working within a value system which marginalises the significance of research on 'women' and 'Scotland', and which prioritises or recognises only so-called mainstream topics for research within a British context.

The problem is not, of course, confined to academia. If women are under-represented in all the key decision-making arenas in Scotland, and if they continue to be disadvantaged in economic, social and political terms, then the amount of interest in understanding women's experience is likely to reflect this unequal balance of power. The low status given to women and to research on women in Scottish universities is thus just one element of this unequal relationship.

But does the lack of research on women in Scotland matter, and to whom? Our answer to the first question is yes. First, it matters on academic and intellectual grounds in terms of the quality of the research. Research which draws general conclusions and develops theories on evidence which is gender-blind, or based solely on data collected outwith Scotland, may not be relevant to Scottish circumstances or the experience of women in Scotland. Second, explanation is important if we want to facilitate social change through policy initiatives. Research should help inform the formulation of strategies for change.

### *Researching Women in Scotland*

The answer to the second question is that research on women matters for women in Scotland. As Engender, the new women's organisation in Scotland, found when it conducted a survey of its members, many women want more information on the position of women but are unable to find it. This has implications for the way in which women perceive themselves and other women in Scottish society. Research on women matters also if we are to understand the nature of Scottish society and such complex issues as cultural and national identity; we cannot do this satisfactorily if we continue to ignore the experience and contribution of women. Further, it could be argued that improving our understanding of gender relations will have benefits for both women and men.

Having argued that the lack of knowledge and information on women in Scottish society does matter, the next question is what can be done to improve the situation? Clearly one way forward is through the provision of resources for research. Our report contains recommendations for the future, among which the key ones are:

- the need for resources to be devoted to research on women and gender;
- the need for collaborative research funding;
- the need for large-scale studies;
- the need for better dissemination of research findings.

The funding of the research review by the EOC is a positive step which perhaps reflects wider changes occurring within the structure of the EOC and the expansion of its role in Scotland. There has been an awareness in the past that very little research in Scotland has been funded by the EOC, and a belief that the EOC has not given adequate recognition to the institutional differences between Scotland and England and Wales. We would hope that the publication of the research review will not only result in future funding of projects in Scotland by the EOC, but will raise awareness and stimulate interest in issues of equality from the wider research community

The institutions of government in Scotland also have a key role to play in promoting research and in disseminating it. This is true both at the level of the Scottish Office and at local government level. The Scottish Office could address the issue of gender in at least two ways: one, by utilising more effectively national data sets, or data it already collects (for example, the Scottish Office Education Department now do this with statistics on education); and by scrutinising its own research agendas to see if proper attention is paid to gender issues. This is not just a matter of running a few

### *Scottish Affairs*

research projects on issues which may be thought to be of special significance for women, but rather asking to what extent work on topics such as housing, urban regeneration, or economic development should include a gender dimension, and whether policies affect women and men differentially. Similarly, improvements could be made at local government level. There seems to be a growing tendency for local authorities to commission studies and surveys, whether on economic forecasting, satisfaction with services, or evaluation of projects which they fund. These too could be scrutinised by those commissioning research for the attention they pay to gender issues.

There is a view that the absence of decision-making or legislative power for Scotland also creates something of a vacuum for research and policy analysis. One possible area for speculation is whether or not constitutional change in Scotland would have an impact on the funding, quantity and quality of research work, and on the status which work conducted in Scotland receives. Would it result, for example, in the development of a research and policy community interested in researching women and gender issues in Scotland? If so, this could provide support not only for those wishing to pursue such topics in academia, but also for promoters of equal opportunities within Scotland, and for women themselves.

An interesting parallel can be drawn with the position of the Scottish poverty lobby, as this too has suffered in the past from poor information and lack of empirical research in Scotland. In an article in 1987, Stephen Maxwell referred to the difficulty in campaigning on the issue of poverty in Scotland and influencing policy decisions because of what he describes as the 'unionist mainstream analysis' of the issue of poverty and the resistance to the inclusion of a Scottish dimension in the debate by academics and others (Maxwell 1987). He makes the case in relation to poverty that there is a need for specialist research institutions in Scotland, for media expertise, and for a Scottish lobby. The same case can be made in relation to women and equal opportunities in Scotland. Nevertheless, just as, in the respect of poverty, there are people in positions of influence in local government familiar with the debate, and a network of specialist workers and voluntary organisations, so too, in respect of gender, there is no lack of interest or expertise in equality issues in Scotland. We, therefore, have the basis for the creation of an equal opportunities research and policy community in Scotland. What we need is both the resources and the political will.

*Researching Women in Scotland*

**REFERENCES**

- Bamford, Caroline (1988). **Gender and Education in Scotland: A Review of Research**. Edinburgh: Scottish Institute of Adult and Continuing Education.
- Breitenbach, Esther and Gordon, Eleanor (eds) (1992). **Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945**. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Brown, Alice (ed) (1991). **Women in Scottish Politics**. Edinburgh: Unit for the Study of Government in Scotland.
- Brown, Sally (1993). Research on Gender in Education: Monitoring Bleakness or Instigating Change?. **Scottish Affairs**, No.5, Autumn.
- Brown, Alice, Breitenbach, Esther and Myers, Fiona (1994). **Equality Issues in Scotland: A Research Review**. Glasgow: Equal Opportunities Commission.
- Brown, Alice and Galligan, Yvonne (1993). Changing the Political Agenda for Women in the Republic of Ireland and in Scotland. **West European Politics**, Vol 16, No 2.
- Brown, Sally and Riddell, Sheila (eds) (1992). **Class, Race and Gender in Schools**. Edinburgh: The Scottish Council for Research in Education.
- Engender (1993). **Gender Audit 1993**. Edinburgh.
- Engender (1994). **Gender Audit 1994**. Edinburgh.
- Gerver, Elizabeth and Hart, Lesley (1991) **Strategic Women: How do they Manage in Scotland**. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.
- Gordon, Eleanor and Breitenbach, Esther (eds) (1990). **The World is Ill-Divided: Women's Work in Scotland in the 19th and Early 20th Centuries**. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Kay, Diana (1984). **Tackling Tribunals**. Glasgow: Scottish Consumer Council.
- King, Elspeth (1992). The Scottish Women's Suffrage Movement. **Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945**. eds Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Leneman, Leah (1991). **A Guid Cause - The Women's Suffrage Movement in Scotland**. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.
- Leonard, Alice (1987) **Phyrric Victories**. London: HMSO.
- Levy, Catriona (1992). A Woman's Place? The Future Scottish Parliament. **The Scottish Government Yearbook 1992**. eds Lindsay Paterson and David McCrone. Edinburgh: Unit for the Study of Government in Scotland.
- Madigan, Ruth (1983) Women and Housing. Glasgow Women's Studies Group **Uncharted Lives**. Glasgow: Pressgang.

*Scottish Affairs*

Marshall, Margaret and Aldred, Chris (1977). **The Equal Pay and Sex Discrimination Acts**. Aberdeen: Aberdeen People's Press.

Maxwell, Stephen (1987). The Politics of Poverty in Scotland. **The Scottish Government Yearbook 1987**. ed. David McCrone. Edinburgh: Unit for the Study of Government in Scotland.

Ross, Jennifer (1993). **Access to Justice for Ethnic Minorities**. Glasgow: Scottish Consumer Council.

Women in Scotland Bibliography Group (1988). **Women in Scotland: An Annotated Bibliography**. Edinburgh: Open University in Scotland.

*June 1994*