

**SHOULD AULD ACQUAINTANCE BE FORGOT ?
A COMPARISON OF THE SCOTS AND ENGLISH
IN SCOTLAND**

Malcolm B. Dickson

SCOTTISH POLITICS AND ANTI-ENGLISH FEELING

Whether on the terraces of Hampden, or more lately at Murrayfield, the expression of rivalry between Scots and English continues to be part of the national life of Scotland. However, this rivalry has always given rise to a fairly weak anti-English sentiment. Scots have overwhelmingly relied on supporting the 'idea' of Scotland through not only sport, but also the traditionally separate institutions of law, education and church. Through these mechanisms the expression of a Scottish 'identity' has been retained. Increasingly, however, the Scots' ability to do so has been brought into question. From time to time the political rise of nationalism as a force in Scotland has, at least implicitly or by association, resulted in a connection between Scotland's ills and the dominant partner within the British state, England. This loose connection has been given extensive airing in the 1980s with the identification of the Westminster government as explicitly an English Tory government. It has been argued that the programme of policies advocated and implemented by the Thatcher governments was essentially English in character. Of course, this has not given sufficient expression to a wider political divide that also embraces the north of England and makes

*Malcolm B. Dickson is a Lecturer in Political Science in the Department of Political Science & Social Policy, University of Dundee, DD1 4HN. He worked as research assistant to the British Rights Study at the University of Glasgow, principal director Prof. W. L. Miller. Thanks is given to the directors of the study for permission to use its data. A fuller account of the British Rights study findings can be found in Miller, W. L. (ed.) (1994), **Alternatives to Freedom: Arguments & Opinions**, London: Longman, forthcoming.*

Scottish Affairs

Scotland less 'different' than it may appear to be, as pointed out by McCrone (1992). The tendency to generalisation in relation to the notion of the 'English' means that the diversity of political, social, economic and cultural circumstances in England has not been given sufficient examination in the public domain. Even within the Labour party in Scotland, the debate has not been focused on how a connection between the situation in Scotland and the north of England can be used to their advantage, but has involved an increase in the expression of explicit nationalist ideas through MPs such as John McAllion.

The continuing existence of the constitutional question in Scotland, and with it the increasing difficulty with which the opposition parties are having in pushing the debate forward, ultimately means that frustration amongst those who are committed to some form of change is felt. How this frustration is acted upon is a key question for the Scottish political process. So far, it has yet to materialise in a persistent mass movement, perhaps because of the lack of consensus on the constitutional solutions available.

The constitutional issue has led in the past to more extreme forms of political action which have been well documented by Scott and Macleay (1990). Since the late 1960s, Scotland has seen sporadic and fairly unsophisticated attempts at political violence. These incidents have involved small numbers of activists, and groups such as the Scottish National Liberation Army have continued to be a fringe element in Scottish politics, with no real community support, large membership or significant resources. The late 1980s saw a virtual disappearance from the Scottish scene of such groups. However, it is fairly clear that there is no real evidence that violent campaigns were directed at the English per se, rather than at the institutions of government and the state, and principally within Scotland. Yet this may be rather surprising given that many other European examples of regionalist or nationalist political violence have involved acts directed specifically at so-called 'incomer' groups. Britain has also shared this experience through the burning of holiday homes in Wales. In other parts of Europe this type of action has occurred in relation to different states, as has happened in the Netherlands against Germans buying coastal holiday homes. In Scotland, 1993 finally saw, in some sense, the arrival of this type of political agitation. During 1993 two groups emerged that lacked any formal political aims other than those directed at protecting Scotland from 'incomers'. Firstly, Settler Watch appeared after a campaign of leaflets and posters using Pictish symbols and slogans was conducted across the Highlands and specifically directed at 'incomers'. One of those involved was actually a German-born vice-convenor

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

of the Scottish National Party in Aberdeen, who was subsequently expelled from the party. This has resulted in the proscription of membership of Settler Watch by the SNP at a conference in December 1993. The SNP have also sought to distance themselves from the second group that emerged in 1993, the Dumfriesshire-based Scottish Watch. Scottish Watch, unlike Settler Watch, have placed themselves directly in the public domain. This has been in part due to the adverse publicity surrounding the Settler Watch poster campaign and subsequent incidents such as the spraying of graffiti on a private housing estate in Inverness. Scottish Watch have themselves tried to dissociate themselves from Settler Watch, but have singularly failed to do so in both media coverage and stances on them taken by the main political parties.

In particular, Scottish Watch's claims can be examined more easily because of the more public nature of their campaigning and their organisation itself. In order to assess the significance of the emergence of specifically anti-English political campaigning in Scotland, the assumptions of groups such as Scottish Watch are worthy of examination. The constitution of Scottish Watch was adopted at an inaugural general meeting held in Perth in October 1993 (Scottish Watch 1993a). Clauses C to H make reference to 'a British colonialist system' and the 'Englishing of Scotland'. In particular Scottish Watch have attempted to advance the argument that English people in Scotland are pushing up property prices and therefore taking the best housing, that in employment Scots are forced to take second best, and that in political and cultural terms the English people in Scotland are distinctly English in their values and opinions. In the case of values and opinions Scottish Watch have suggested that English people have a distinctly Thatcherite outlook. In order to test these claims the characteristics of English people in Scotland need to be examined and compared to the characteristics of native Scots.

SCOTS BORN AND ENGLISH BORN IN SCOTLAND: A COMPARISON

If identification (and comparison) of groups such as the 'English in Scotland' are to be usefully made, then some analytical definition must be used. The result of failing to do this is to rule out effective comparisons. The nature of what makes an individual 'Scottish' or 'English' is indeed problematic, as Kellas (1989) rightly notes. This is even further confused by competing ideas of Scottish national identity discussed by McCrone (1992). However, simply

Scottish Affairs

to dismiss comparisons on this basis alone would mean that subjective comparisons of the 'English' and the 'Scots', which undoubtedly exist at some level, could not be explored, validated or challenged. Any complex definition would also provide difficulty for analysis because of the nature of data available. In many respects, the best available analytical definition is place of birth. This is to be found commonly in many different survey data sources from the Census through to smaller scale commercial opinion polls. This is in fact the very starting point taken in the research that has been carried out by groups such as Scottish Watch (1993b) in an attempt to back up their claims about English people in Scotland. Of course, it may be the case that this definition would conflict with a subjective assignment of any individual; however, this has not hindered other forms of objective analysis in the social sciences, for example in relation to class. Indeed, Kellas (1989, p.125) notes that the number of Scots identifiers is closely related to the number of Scots born. Therefore, although not perfect, the use of place of birth as a defining characteristic does allow some form of effective comparison in order to explore the nature of the English born population in Scotland, and the validity of the claims of groups such as Scottish Watch.

The comparisons explored here are based upon data from the British Rights Study, details of which can be found in Appendix A. Only comparisons between the groups as whole are explored in detail here. Gender differences between the two groups were particularly small and did not contradict patterns that have been established in recent years, for example in employment and political attitudes and which have been well documented in such surveys as the British Social Attitudes series. The study did not use an objective class measure such as the Registrar General's socio-economic group classification. As a result class differences are difficult to establish. However, a combination of economic activity, income and subjective class measures are detailed in the comparison below.

Before simply identifying those English born living in Scotland, it is useful to note not only country of birth, but also the region. Table 1 indicates the broad regional origin of English born people living in Scotland. In comparison with the regional place of birth of those actually living in England, the make-up of the English born in Scotland is reasonably similar. There is certainly no evidence that English born people living in Scotland are proportionately dominated by those born in the south or London. The proportion from London and the south rises slightly amongst those who are retired, both compared with the rest of the English born population in Scotland and with the proportion of English born retirees in England.

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

However, in absolute terms these differences can only account for a very small number of people when set against the proportion of retirees amongst the English born population as a whole (see Table 3).

Table 1: Area of birth

	% English born living in Scotland	% English born and retired living in Scotland	% English born living in England	% English born and retired living in England
North	37.5	36	36.1	41.8
Midlands	10.1	4	18.3	15
South	26.8	24	29.3	20
London	18.5	28	15.8	23.2
Don't know	4.8	4	0.5	0

For sample sizes, see Appendix

The 1991 Census returns and the 1993 figures from the Registrar General show that net migration in relation to Scotland is broadly flat. In other words, there are roughly the same number of people leaving Scotland as coming in. Of those who migrate into Scotland, a significant proportion are made up of Scots returning to Scotland. Indeed, the proportion of English born in Scotland has seen only a modest rise in the last twenty years, and it is still well below 10 per cent of the overall population of Scotland. The 1991 Census figures show that the settlement of English born in Scotland is relatively uneven. This has provoked particular interest in the effects of migration into rural areas. However, looking at the global number of English born in Scotland (Table 2), it can be seen that only just over one third live in out-and-out rural areas as defined by respondents themselves. In comparison with the Scottish born living in rural areas, this constitutes a 12 per cent proportional difference. There is, then, some evidence for uneven settlement;

Scottish Affairs

however, it is not within the scope of this analysis to make any claims about the localised effects that such differences have. Nonetheless, it should be pointed out that the largest proportion of the English born in Scotland can be found living in urban areas, but the perceived problems that Scottish Watch have drawn attention to do not seem to exist in urban areas. It may well be the case that any effects that are felt by communities are related to low population density and the accompanying higher 'visibility' of anyone coming into the area, and not necessarily to their country of origin.

Table 2: Proportion of population living in urban, town and rural areas

	English born living in Scotland%	Scottish born living in Scotland%
Urban	36.9	39.4
Town	27.4	37.5
Rural	35.7	23

Q. What about now, do you live in:...a big town or city; a small town; OR a rural area?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Further evidence of the influence of population density on the perceived effects of inward migration can be found in a more detailed breakdown of the characteristics of the English born living in Scotland. In many ways, there is a remarkable similarity between the English born and Scottish born populations. Further, where there are differences, they are often contrary to the types of arguments being advanced by groups who have claimed that the English born living in Scotland have characteristics far out of line with the rest of Scotland.

Table 3 shows the comparison in economic activity between the Scots and English born sections of the population. The proportion of those in work of one form or another is not significantly different: 66 per cent for English born against 63.7 per cent for indigenous Scots. There is also close similarity in the proportion of people retired. This seems to contradict the view that English people coming into Scotland consist of a higher proportion of retired people. In fact, a large proportion of those English born who have retired

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

have spent some, if not the greater proportion, of their working lives in Scotland. There is no evidence to support the claim that a large number of English people retire to Scotland.

Even in unemployment rates, there is only a gap of around 1 per cent. (The unemployment figures in Table 3 are expressed as a percentage of the total population rather than as a percentage of the total available workforce.) Again, there is no substantive evidence of indigenous Scots being

Table 3: Economic activity

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Self employed	13.1	10.4
Full time	46.4	42.4
Part time	6.5	10.9
At home	5.4	6.7
Retired	14.9	14.3
Unemployed	4.8	6
Student	5.4	5.1
Unable to work	1.8	3.5
Other	1.8	0.8

For sample sizes, see Appendix

significantly worse off. The current patterns of unemployment are hitting the English born in Scotland almost as hard.

Debate about the nature of employment amongst the English born in Scotland continues to concentrate on the number of English people in so-called 'top jobs'. Again, the issue here might be the visibility of top positions, and how that affects perceptions about the general nature of the organisations and how they are run. Tables 4 and 5 give a broader perspective on this particular aspect. The public sector accounts for 48.3 per cent of employment amongst English born, while 43.2 per cent amongst Scots. This five per cent difference is spread across the various areas of the public sector as shown in Table 4, with no one area possessing more than a four per cent gap. It is interesting - in light of statements made in leaflets published by Scottish

Scottish Affairs

Watch in relation to the perceived 'Thatcherite' nature of the English population in Scotland - that private sector employment accounts for almost ten per cent more of the total for indigenous Scots than for the English born. However, the 3.9 per cent gap in the proportion employed in education does lend some weight to the 'Anglicisation' thesis. How much effect, in terms of the nature of Scottish education, this may have is a matter for closer scrutiny. The effects, if any, would depend upon there being a difference in political culture and policy between Scots and English born.

Table 4: Employees: sector of employment

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Private	44.9	53.5
Education	15.7	11.8
Health	12.4	10.8
Social services	2.2	3.3
Civil service	5.6	4.6
Local government	9	8.1
Nationalised industry/ public corporation	3.4	4.6
Other	5.6	3.1

For sample sizes, see Appendix

**Table 5: Employees: proportion considering themselves
management/workforce**

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Management	31.5	25.4
Workforce	60.7	68

For sample sizes, see Appendix

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

Table 5 suggests that the proportion of employees in influential positions is only marginally higher amongst English people than Scots. The idea of English people occupying 'top jobs' is not sustained by these data.

Difficulties with the 'top jobs' argument can also be found in the income-structure comparison between English and Scots (Table 6). The similarity of the income structure contains evidence that the relative spending power of the English born in Scotland is not significantly different from that of

Table 6: Income Structure

	% English born living in Scotland in each income band	Cumulative % of English born living in Scotland earning up to largest amount in each income band	% Scottish born living in Scotland in each income band	Cumulative % of Scottish born living in Scotland earning up to largest amount in each income band
Up to £5000	11	11	23.8	23.8
£6000 to £10000	18.1	29.1	18.1	41.9
£11000 to £15000	21.3	50.4	19.7	61.5
£16000 to £20000	17.3	67.7	16.9	78.5
£21000 to £25000	10.2	78	7.7	86.2
£26000 to £30000	9.4	87.4	5.9	92.1
£31000 to £35000	3.9	91.3	2.9	95
£36000 to £40000	3.9	95.3	1.6	96.6
£41000 to £45000	1.6	96.9	1.1	97.7

Scottish Affairs

£46000 and above	3.1	100	2.3	100
---------------------	-----	-----	-----	-----

For sample sizes, see Appendix

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

indigenous Scots. While the overall average income is slightly higher for English born people, the distribution of incomes is fairly parallel. Further analysis of the British Rights Study data indicated that the divergence at the under-five-thousand mark is in part due to a much higher proportion of part-time workers amongst Scots, and that Scots pensioners are worse off than their English counterparts. However, English born pensioners are not significantly better off, with most of the difference at the under-five-thousand-pounds level being balanced out at between six and ten thousand pounds.

In the middle-income rang^{es} that account for the bulk of the population there is the greatest degree of congruence between the English and Scots. Even at the high income end of the scale, Scots are not doing significantly worse than their English born counterparts.

Recent arguments over the position of English people in Scotland advanced by groups such as Scottish Watch have also focused on the issue of housing and home ownership. The argument has essentially attempted to suggest that English people choosing to come to live in Scotland were taking up better housing at the expense of native Scots. As a result of this 'influx', house prices were pushed up, pricing locals out of the market. While there is no doubt that in fragile economic circumstances in some areas of rural Scotland, price increases in property will have a disproportionate effect, to blame such increases on any single group of people fails to address the wider issues of the property market of the 1980s. These include a move towards viewing housing as a commodity for profit, backed up by the eager lending policies of banks and building societies following the deregulation of financial services in 1986.

In fact, Table 7 points to an almost identical proportion of home owners among English born people living in Scotland in comparison to Scots. It is particularly worthy of note that 1 in 4 English people are actually in rented accommodation. This, added to the income pattern, does not suggest an English 'takeover' of the best housing stock in Scotland. Additionally, those English people in rented accommodation do not disproportionately come from groups in employment, which might be expected if English people in Scotland were more intinerant than their Scots counterparts. Indeed, amongst those in full and part time employment the proportion of those owning their accomodation is slightly higher (80 percent) amongst English born in comparison to Scottish born (77 percent).

Scottish Affairs

Table 7: Type of housing occupancy

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Own	72.6	70.1
Rent	25.6	28.3
Other	1.8	1.3

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Table 8: Owner occupiers: source of home financing

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Mortgage	75.4	73.7
Own outright	24.6	25.6

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Further, the financing of owner occupancy, as shown in Table 8, shows that, in both English and Scottish population groups, 3 out of 4 home owners are reliant on a mortgage. It is clear that if there is 'pricing out of the market', it is affecting not only indigenous Scots, but also English people in Scotland.

Table 9 shows the breakdown of landlords of those in rented accommodation. Here, there is significant difference between the proportions renting in the private and public sectors. The proportion of Scots renting in the public sector is almost twice as large as the corresponding proportion of the English born residents of Scotland. This could be superficially interpreted as evidence that public housing allocation is discriminating against English people in Scotland, although such a conclusion would require far more exploration than can be made here. However, what these figures do indicate is that, at least in the rented sector, English born people are having to pay more for their accommodation. The proportion of English people renting in

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

the relatively expensive private sector is almost three times as high as that for Scots.

Table 9: Rented sector: type of landlord

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Private	34.9	12.5
Council	39.5	70.6
Housing Association	18.6	15.6

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Table 10: Recent recipients of unemployment benefit/income support

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Recipient of benefit	26.8	32.3	33.7
Not a recipient of benefit	71.4	66.9	65

Q. Now in the last few years have you, OR anyone in your household received unemployment benefit OR income support from the government ?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Further indication that English people are just as susceptible to the economic pressures of Scotland in the 1990s is shown in Table 10. While the proportion of Scots receiving benefit is higher, over one quarter of English households in Scotland are also in receipt of benefit, or have been in the last few years. Indeed, the difference in the totals can be partly accounted for by the higher proportion of Scots employees in part-time employment.

Scottish Affairs

Leaflets recently published by Scottish Watch (1993b) have made references to the 'Thatcherite' nature of English people who have settled in Scotland. In many respects, this is not borne out in practice. An initial indication of the extent of behaviour which was at least encouraged by Thatcherism is shown

Table 11: Recent recipients of private medical care

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Received private medical treatment	13.1	10.6	19.2
Have not received private medical treatment	86.3	88.4	79.5

Q. Now in the last few years have you, OR anyone in your household had any medical treatment as a private, fee-paying patient ?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

in Table 11, relating to the levels of private medical care. There are modestly more English people who have recently received private medical treatment, but the overwhelming majority of both English and Scots have not.

Perhaps the most interesting indications of the relative lack of Thatcherite values can be found in voting preferences and political attitudes. Table 12 shows the totals for voting preference in answer to the question 'If there were a general election tomorrow, which party would you most likely vote for?' Of immediate significance is that just under ten per cent of English people indicated a preference for the SNP. This indicates some measure of a 'Scottishing' of English attitudes. If the Thatcherite nature of English people was to be substantiated, it might be expected that the proportion indicating a preference for the Conservative party would be at least at the same level as that in England. However, there is in fact a considerably different pattern, with English people in Scotland being much less likely to support the Conservatives than English people in England.

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

In the general election of April 1992, the Conservatives received 41.9 per cent of the vote in Britain as a whole, and 45.5 per cent in England alone. The British Rights Study Scottish sample interviews were conducted after the election, and, as a result, data was collected on how people had actually voted. Table 13 shows similar results to the voting preferences in Table 12: the proportion of English people in Scotland voting for the Conservative

Scottish Affairs

Table 12: Voting preference at time of survey

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Conservative	28.6	19	38.1
Labour	26.8	34.2	29.7
SNP	8.3	22.8	-
Liberal Dem.	22	11.1	17.8
Green	4.2	0.4	1.6
Other	0.6	0.1	0.5
Would not vote	4.2	4.3	5.7
Don't know	5.4	7.1	5.2

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Table 13: Voting in 1992 general election

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Conservative	35.8	24.1	46.3
Labour	26.3	36.4	31
SNP	9.5	23.3	-
Liberal Dem.	24.1	13.3	19.1
Green	1.5	0.3	0.6
Other	0.7	0.1	0.9

Confined to people who reported having voted in the election

For sample sizes, see Appendix

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

Table 14: taxes or public spending

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Cut taxes	22.6	25.3	23.3
Increase public spending	75.6	72.5	72.6
Don't know	1.8	2.2	3.9

Q: If the government found that it had a surplus of cash available, which should it do?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

party was a full ten percentage points below the average for voters in England. Further, almost ten per cent voted for the SNP. The total for the Liberal Democrats among English born voters in Scotland in 1992 was also five per cent higher than the English average of 19.2 per cent. Overall, these patterns in Tables 12 and 13 clearly do not support the idea that English people in Scotland have a particular leaning toward the Conservative party.

One of the major cornerstones of the Thatcher programme was based upon particular ideas about the role and scope of government. In practice, this translated to attempts to constrain public spending, and giving individuals more 'spending power' through cuts in direct taxation. Again, if Thatcherite ideals were to be exhibited by English people living in Scotland, then it might be reasonable to assume that this would be reflected in attitudes to government spending and taxation. In the British Rights Study this was tested by asking respondents what they felt government should do if it had a surplus of cash available: cut taxes or increase public spending. The results in Table 14 provide a somewhat surprising pattern. The 'Thatcherite' solution of cutting taxes is actually favoured by a higher proportion of Scots than English born. Overall, there is very little support for this cornerstone of Thatcherite economic philosophy among either Scots or English in Scotland, a pattern which is also reflected in attitudes in England.

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

Another aspect of the recent controversy over the position of English people in Scotland has revolved around the level of involvement in local social, political and cultural activities. Yet again, Table 15 shows virtually no

Scottish Affairs

Table 15: Contact with elected and non-elected branches of government

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Councillor	32.1	32.7
Council offices	38.1	38.1
MP	28	22

For sample sizes, see Appendix

Table 16: Religion

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %
Church of England	26.2	2
Church of Scotland	20.8	51.1
Other Protestant	8.3	11.1
Roman Catholic	5.4	12.1
Other	3	1.1
Not Religious	27.4	19.1
Don't know	3.6	1.2

For sample sizes, see Appendix

difference in level of contact with local branches of government. There is a higher contact rate with MPs among English people, but it is still only just over one in four against just over one in five for Scots. If the local political process is the focus of attention, then the remarkable similarity between Scots and English levels of contact with councillors and council offices offers scant evidence of an English 'take-over' of local affairs.

Examination of other forms of involvement and participation continues to show difficulties in any easy assumptions about the make-up of the English born population in Scotland. Table 16 shows the stated religion of

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

respondents. Another indication of a possible 'Scottishing' effect experienced by English born people can be seen in the fact that over one in five of

Table 17: Level of active involvement

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Sports club	36.3	31.2	29.7
Arts organisation	15.5	10.4	11
School organisation	10.7	12.5	13.3
Religious organisation	23.8	20.1	16.4
Charity work	35.1	25.7	29.7
Active in Trade Union	19	14.5	11.8
Active in business organisation	9.5	5.4	6.4
Election campaign	11.3	7	6.3
Other political campaigning	7.1	3.1	2.4
Community problem	31.9	22.3	26.6
Signed a petition	74.4	68.5	70.5
Demonstration	17.3	15	12.4

Q. In the last few years, have you taken an ACTIVE part in.....?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

English people state their religion as Church of Scotland. As might be predicted, the proportion of Church of England identifiers is considerably less among native Scots, but a substantial proportion of the 'Church of England' identifiers in Scotland will in fact be adherents of the Scottish Episcopal Church, which is independent of the Church of England. Both English and Scots born show considerable diversity of religious attachment.

In other forms of activities, there are some differences in the levels of active participation between the English born and Scottish born sections of the

Scottish Affairs

population, as shown in Table 17. There is generally a slightly higher level of participation by English born people but not by hugely significant amounts. Scots, interestingly, have a higher proportion of people in active involvement are schools groups, although the evidence is not strong. This has been

Table 18: Discrimination

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Yes	32.8	28.3	26.4
No	66.7	71.6	70.5

Q: Have you personally ever felt discriminated against in some important matter ?

For sample sizes, see Appendix

another area where concern has been voiced over the level of English involvement, yet the figures would further point to this as an overstated position. However, the generally higher participation rates by the English born in all the other activities listed in Table 17 may suggest a possible imbalance in influence, particularly when the gap is more significant, as is the case with involvement in arts organisations. What these figures cannot reveal at this level is the pattern of power and control within these participatory areas. However, the fact that higher rates of participation are also evident in trade unions does seem to suggest that the political composition of participation is diverse, and may reflect the fuller diversity of political positions held by English people in Scotland, rather than a more sectional or singularly partisan pattern.

Finally, in comparing English born and Scots born people in Scotland, the British Rights Survey offers some interesting evidence in relation to the issue of discrimination. Firstly, as indicated in Table 18, discrimination of some form or another has been felt by a higher proportion of English people than Scots. In addition, those who had said that they had experienced some form of discrimination were asked to indicate the reason for the discrimination (Table 19).

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

Table 19 contains the breakdown of reasons for discrimination. If the totals for race and ethnic background are added together, then the proportion of English born people who have felt discrimination on the basis of those reasons is 18.2 per cent. The corresponding proportional total for Scots is only 7.9 per cent, less than half of the total for English people. This may raise questions about the way English people are already being treated in Scotland. Further analysis of the data also showed that those who have felt

Table 19. Reason for discrimination

	English born living in Scotland %	Scottish born living in Scotland %	English born living in England %
Sex	47.3	43.6	40.6
Race	10.9	4.8	8.6
Ethnic background	7.3	3.1	2.2
Religion	5.5	13.8	8.1
Age	16.4	15.6	19.1
Disability	0	3.1	4.6
Political beliefs	3.6	8.7	5.6
Other	9.1	6.2	9.8

For sample sizes, see Appendix

discrimination on the basis of race or ethnic background are overwhelmingly white: over 95% for both Scots and English born living in Scotland. Of course, groups such as Scottish Watch have advocated forms of positive discrimination in favour of Scots, but it appears that informally this may already be occurring to some extent. Scots, too, diverge in patterns of discrimination felt in the areas of religion and political beliefs. The religious discrimination level difference is mainly accounted for by the greater proportion of Catholics amongst the Scottish population. The fact that, even as the twentieth century draws to a close, almost 1 in 7 Scots have experienced discrimination on the basis of religion is worthy of note.

The higher discrimination on the basis of political beliefs felt by Scots may in part be due to some effects felt by those supporting a nationalist position,

Scottish Affairs

particularly in the form of supporting or voting SNP. This is also, perhaps, a surprising situation in a country which has supposedly had a tradition of egalitarianism and tolerance. With nearly a third of Scots and English people having experienced some form of discrimination, the evidence for Scotland as an egalitarian and tolerant society is somewhat weakened.

CONCLUSIONS

Overall, when comparisons are made between English and Scots born people in Scotland, there are undoubted differences between the groups. However, the pattern, or direction, of the differences does not offer any great support to the view that English people in Scotland are better off, live in better housing and have better jobs, and are taking over positions of control and influence in a disproportionate way. In fact, there is more evidence to support the idea that English born people have in many respects assimilated themselves into many aspects of Scottish life, not open to them in England, for example in politics and religion. From this, it could be argued that the broader English population in Scotland has experienced some form of 'Scottishing' effect. However, although this analysis has focused on the Scotland-wide situation, there is also concern about the localised effects of population composition and movement. Unfortunately, sample size prevents this analysis from examining small localities. Therefore, while there is little evidence to support a wide problem, it may well be the case that localised problems do occur in areas where economic and social infrastructures are more fragile and vulnerable. In these cases, any population shifts, involving not just English people, may have a disproportionate affect on local affairs. These problems cannot be explained simply in terms of the population groups involved. There is no real evidence of a 'colonial' intention in population shifts, as an examination of the make-up of the English people in Scotland shows. Further, there are other wider factors, not related to specific groups, that have an effect or influence on local communities. In the 1980s these have included a general housing boom, which Scotland was not untouched by, and which was in part due to the political and economic climate of the mid to late 1980s. In this period, the lending policies of banks and building societies, accompanied by a changing view of property as a commodity, fuelled a general, and overheated, rise in property prices. The 1980s has also seen restrictions of public sector provision of housing, including government policies geared towards the 'right to buy' council houses, while constraining local authority spending in providing upgrades to existing stock or the financing of new home building programmes. Against this background, the

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

reasons for any localised problems that may occur because of migration patterns are much more complex than those associated with the nature or character of people who move in to any particular area.

In many respects the most significant comparisons are in the similarity between the English and Scots born populations. This, added to the fact that in key political attitudes the English in Scotland are significantly different from the English in England, means that overall the claims of groups such as Scottish Watch over a widespread and dangerous problem are probably somewhat exaggerated.

APPENDIX

The British Rights Study was carried out at Glasgow University during 1991 and 1992. The study was directed by W. L. Miller and M. Lessnoff of Glasgow University and A. M. Timpson of Nottingham University, with M. Dickson and M. Brown as research assistants. It was loosely modelled on the innovative Canadian Charter Study directed by Professors Peter Russell and Joseph Fletcher (Toronto), Philip Tetlock (Berkeley, CA) and Paul Sniderman (Stanford).

The study made extensive use of innovative Computer Assisted Telephone Interviewing Techniques (CATI) and comprised four samples:

- British cross-section - 2060 interviews with a random sample of the British population over eighteen years old.
- Scottish cross-section - 1255 interviews with a random sample of the Scottish population over eighteen years old (212 of these also form part of the British cross-section sample).
- Political leaders - 1244 interviews with a sample of political leaders in Britain.
- Interviewers - 109 self-interviews with the survey's interviewing staff.

Sampling

The cross-section samples were drawn from the latest versions of the 98 British Telecom telephone directories. The sampling procedure took note of the problems associated with telephone interviewing, and in particular provision was made to access ex-directory numbers using a systematic alteration of the base telephone numbers originally extracted from the directories. When selected, the numbers were presented to interviewers in a random stream, thus avoiding both interviewer bias and space-time correlation bias.

Response rate & Representativeness

The cross-section samples were based on 'cold-calling', and a random selection of adults present in the household. For the British sample, 10602 numbers were dialled

Scottish Affairs

to obtain 2060 interviews, with 4101 of these either business, fax or unobtainable numbers. This represents a response rate of 32 percent. This is low compared to surveys in which named individuals are contacted before interview, but it is comparable with the response rates in the standard quota sampled surveys used in commercial market research. This type of survey is most often used in polls measuring voting intention which are published regularly in the press.

For both the British and Scottish samples there would be an expectation of some level of bias in representativeness. The net social bias caused by sampling and response rates was calculated from a comparison of the collected data with, in the case of the British sample, the 1991 **General Household Survey** published by the government's Office of Population Censuses and Surveys (OPCS), and in the case of the Scottish survey, three government publications - **Scottish Abstract of Statistics**, the **Labour Force Survey** and **Regional Trends**. A net regional bias was also calculated from superimposing parliamentary constituency boundaries on the boundaries of the British Telecom directories to establish the total electorate in each BT directory region.

These comparisons were then used to provide components for a weighting variable to be applied to the samples in order to bring the representativeness of the samples into line with the targets in the government publications. For the British sample a five component iterative rim weighting scheme with two iterations was used, and for the Scottish sample here was an additional regional adjustment. The weighting scheme resulted in an average representativeness bias of one percent and a maximum bias of three percent.

Margin of Error

For a systematic random sample drawn from the populations of Great Britain and Scotland the margins of error at the 95 percent confidence level, and where the expected distribution of answers to any particular question are even, are as follows:

	Sampling Error
Scottish sample 1255	+/- 3 %
British sample 2060	Between +/- 3 % and +/- 2%

The English born element of the Scottish sample numbered 168 cases, resulting in an expected margin of error at the 95 percent confidence level of +/- 8 percent. Although this appears large, it is common in surveys of this type to examine sub-samples of this order of size. The English born element of the British sample (living in England) numbered 1472, and therefore has a margin of error of +/- 3 percent.

REFERENCES

- Dickson, M. B. (1993). Questioning the Scottish Question. **The Question of the Constitution of Scotland**, ed. A. Black, 21-27. Dundee: Dept. of Political Science & Social Policy, University of Dundee.

A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland

- Fry, M. (1987). **Patronage and Principle: A Political History of Modern Scotland**. Aberdeen: University Press.
- Kellas, J. (1989). **The Scottish Political System**. Cambridge: University Press, fourth edition.
- Levy, R. (1990). **Scottish Nationalism at the Crossroads**. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press.
- McCrone, D. (1992). **Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a Stateless Nation**. London: Routledge.
- Mitchell, J. (1990). **Conservatives and the Union: A Study of Conservative Party Attitudes to Scotland**. Edinburgh: University Press.
- Nairn, T. (1977). **The Break-up of Britain**. London: Verso.
- Scott, A. M. & Macleay, I. (1990). **Britain's Secret War: Tartan Terrorism and the Anglo-American State**. Edinburgh: Mainstream.
- Scottish Watch. (1993a). **Constitution of Scottish Watch**.
- Scottish Watch. (1993b). **The Struggle for Scotland**.
- Smout, T. C. (1986). **A Century of the Scottish People 1830-1950**. London: Fontana Press.
- March 1994*