

Scottish Affairs

a rural rather than urban industry, was coming to an end, while Shetland was involved in the growth of the North Sea oil industry. The role of natural change diminished during the two decades to become a subsidiary influence as a component of net change. As before, when the rural population decline slowed or stabilised in the nineteen thirties, it is likely that the growth in population in rural areas will comprise a greater number of people moving into the towns in these areas rather than into the countryside.

Beyond securing the demographic facts, empirical research has been preoccupied with detecting the causes of counterstream migration. This has generally consisted of sample surveys of immigrants into rural areas where the questionnaires seek to discover the migrants' motives. They are then analysed to disclose the distribution of these reasons among the kinds of people who emerge in the survey sample. Migrants are usually, on the basis of their motives, classified into three categories: one, those for whom employment is not a factor but who find living in a rural area more congenial than a large town; two, those who have had to move into the rural area because of their employment; and, three, those who have tried to meet a preference for living in the countryside with a need to earn a living. These findings are then compared with reports of similar research in other parts of the country with respect to the different proportions in each category, and this leads to debates about the relative validity of voluntarist theories (counterstream migrants choose to live in the countryside as a 'lifestyle' option), the consequences of state intervention through various development agencies, grants and tax incentives, and structural changes in industrial production (see, for example, H. Jones, N. Ford, J. Caird, and W. Berry 1984; for an English study, see N. Bolton and B. Chalkley 1990).

In Scotland there is also a vigorous public debate about the social and cultural impact of migration into Scotland, especially into rural areas. Expressions of concern range from the editorial launching a new magazine, **Wester Ross Life** (1994, p.26), which declares, rather anxiously, that it will not 'shy away' from 'controversy', which turns out to be discussing in a balanced way the 'influx' of incomers, to the wilder activities, declarations, and publications of various individuals describing themselves as 'Settler Watch', and 'Scottish Watch'. These two groups attracted considerable press coverage in the late summer and autumn of 1993, and not only in Scotland: both John Hancox (1993) in **The Guardian**, and Neal Ascherson (1993) in **The Independent** took up considerable space to address themselves to the meaning of these events. Scottish Watch (1994) have used Census data in one of their pamphlets to support their claim that repopulation amounts to the English 'flooding' into Scotland, that the Scottish people are the victims of a

Incomers and Locals

new wave of clearances which are being carried out by the cheque book rather than the torch, and that the indigenous culture is being eradicated. There is an 'Englishing of Scotland' underway. However, Dickson (1994), in this journal, has carried out a detailed analysis of survey data relating to Scotland in general rather than rural Scotland alone, and concluded that 'there is more evidence to support the idea that the English born people have in many respects assimilated themselves into many aspects of Scottish life...it could be argued that the broader English population in Scotland has experienced some form of "Scottishing" effect' (1994, p.131).

WHO ARE THE INCOMERS?

Such investigations into the attributes and impact of migrants seem obvious and natural enough. The rather abstract demographic concept of 'counterstream migration' is recognised in practice, in situations, for example, where the researchers are explaining the nature of their enquiries, as the 'problem of incomers'. The matter of 'incomers' is an issue in which everyone has an interest, and people soon, and with enthusiasm, recount incidents from their own experience, or those of other people, in terms of relationships between locals and incomers. It is presumed that academic research would also take for granted the existential reality of 'incomers' and set about answering, using scientific methods, such worrying questions as 'what kind of people are they?' 'how many of them are there?' 'why do they do it?' Clearly for some people there are important questions to be raised about incomers. The existence, in general terms, of locals and incomers is, to all concerned, so obviously a feature of the rural social setting that it seems that the only meaningful questions that can be raised concern the empirical attributes of locals and incomers. Ordinary people in their everyday lives manage adequately with vaguely defined words since in practice 'everyone knows who the locals/incomers are'. Scientific investigation, however, needs objectively defined terms. The presumption is that the scientific vocabulary is no more than an accurate version of the everyday vernacular. This article arises out of a scepticism about such a presumption.

It is argued here that the apparently simple shift from the vernacular vocabulary to the technical terms and definitions of demography is not a move from a set of loosely defined inexact terms to some clearly defined scientific terms, from inaccurate to accurate representations of reality. Rather, there is a quite radical change of language from a vocabulary which is fundamentally metaphorical to an account which strives to represent the objective reality of migration in a literal way. Moving between these two

Scottish Affairs

modes of representation is not a simple matter of tightening up on definitions. Consider the following three cases.

First of all there is the experience of an American author of a sociological study of an Argyllshire community. He had, after several months residence among the people, come to accept, like the residents themselves, the pervasive sense of the settlement being divided into 'locals' and 'incomers' since these concepts underpinned the people's understanding of their own history and that of the events which constituted the history of the locality. So he was surprised, and that is the important fact, to discover after he had carried out an objective statistical survey that the settlement had been almost entirely repopulated by in-migration. Out of fifty nine household heads, only seven had been born in the locality (Stephenson 1984, pp.124-7).

Secondly, the irrelevance of objective considerations in the definition of locals and of incomers is manifest in attempts to use the terms in a way which discounts their symbolic, or metaphorical, value and takes them at their face value. Highland Regional Council, which is considered to be the most advanced of all Scottish Local Authorities in its concern to establish planning regulations and controls which will promote low-cost housing for local people, arrives at a definition, as it must, of a local person as one who has been 'ordinarily resident for at least three years in a specified area', and Dumbarton District Council has defined a local person for the purposes of controlling housing in the Loch Lomond area as someone who has been continuously resident in the area for eighteen months (Scottish Homes 1991, pp.45, 53-6). The notion that someone might become a 'local' a year and a half after moving into a locality is quite incompatible with the rhetorical sense of the term.

Thirdly, that the vocabulary of 'locals' and 'incomers' is not a literal description of reality is also evident in the way the terms are used. Rather than indicating a puzzling and problematic experience requiring explanation, they are deployed in making sense of otherwise abnormal events and experiences in the locality. As a consequence of their compelling obviousness, these concepts function as terminal points in explanatory accounts, and in the interpretation of controversial events. For example, whatever else people might recall about the extraordinary events in 1992 on Orkney concerning allegations of Satanic and ritual child abuse, everyone remarks that either the families, or the social workers, or both, were 'incomers'. More commonly, a sense of the lack of availability of housing in a rural locality is often accounted for in terms of the relationship between locals and incomers. Such accounts have a long history which is more or less

Incomers and Locals

independent of general demographic trends in rural-urban or urban-rural migration, whether in England, or in Scotland. There are reports from before the First World War of an insufficiency of housing for local people in the English countryside being aggravated by the competition of townspeople 'turning cottages into villas and to the increasing tendency, fostered by bicycles, of urban workers living in rural districts' (Board of Agriculture and Fisheries 1913, p.4). Forty years or so later and another Government report notes the 'antagonism' between 'townspeople' and 'country people', and remarks that incomers have acquired cottages that would 'ordinarily have been available for the countryman' (Ministry of Works and Planning 1942, p.27). Fifty years on again and Scottish Homes reports the commonly held view that 'one of the major difficulties in developing owner-occupation was the influence from outside housing markets with people moving into rural areas and buying houses for significantly above the local market value'(Scottish Homes 1990, p.9). What is striking is the notion that 'incomers' are somehow out of place and disturbing what would 'ordinarily' be the case. The discrepancy between expectations, such as 'a local market value', and reality, the price houses are actually bought and sold for, is accounted for by the presence of incomers. This suggests that as the number and variety of incidents departing from what is considered by some people as normal or ordinary increases - including, perhaps, such incidents as rural repopulation after generations of depopulation - so will their sense of the presence of increasing numbers of incomers.

Therefore, to the extent that the topic of counterstream migration resolves itself into discourse about 'locals' and 'incomers', it supplies explanatory concepts, rather than defines the beginning of a researchable problem into which an objective investigation might be carried out. In short, the vocabulary of 'locals' and 'incomers' is a complex and deeply embedded metaphor providing the terms through which people express and give meaning to the experiences which constitute their lives. The social anthropological interest lies in the metaphorical and symbolic attributes of the vernacular concepts and the ways in which they structure experience.

In this rhetoric a normal community is a community of 'locals', one with out 'incomers' and, as the term 'incomer' itself suggests, there was, in the life of a community, a time in the past when this was true, and, if there are presently incomers, will be true in the future when the incomers have been assimilated. This feeling is well exemplified in Norman MacCaig's poem 'A man in Assynt' which concludes wistfully imagining the repopulation of Scottish shores and glens (MacCaig 1985). The poet remembers the depopulation of the Highlands as he watches the tide withdraw, baring the rocks and sand,

Scottish Affairs

and then he thinks and hopes that as the tide will eventually return so that other 'sad withdrawal of people, may too reverse itself and flood the bays and sheltered glens with new generations'. The unstated assumption, which is virtually universal in all expressions of concern about Scottish rural depopulation, is that repopulation will be achieved by 'locals'. The 'dying landscape belongs to the dead, the crofters and fighters and fishermen' and the implication is that it will come alive again only after some kind of mass resurrection.

In fact, shortly after MacCaig published his poem in 1969, young men and women did appear on the deserted shores of the sea lochs and in the silent glens where they set about with great effort and considerable ingenuity rebuilding crofts and farms abandoned a generation ago. They had been abandoned because of the displacement of the old sea routes by roads, and by the introduction of public utilities such as electricity which also introduced differences and relative deprivations which rendered some holdings unlettable. However, such differences were in part precisely what was attractive to the kind of young people who had travelled in places such as India and South America, who came not only from urban Scotland but also from North America, South Africa, and other continents, as well as Yorkshire, or Derbyshire, and elsewhere, and many had attended prestigious universities. Ironically they were relearning, sometimes deliberately sometimes by accident, the old crofting and fishing skills, and raising families in circumstances that other people consider to be no longer acceptable to present generations.

Given the metaphorical force of the notions of local and incomer, in the sense that their obviousness is such a matter of common sense that they can be appealed to in order to interpret and bring meaning to events and experiences, what then is the source of the obviousness of these ideas? In other words their compelling quality has to be accounted for in ways other than by looking for the empirical attributes of such entities in some objective reality, since that effect, trying to identify incomers and locals, is a possibility which is suggested only by the usages of the words themselves.

NOBLE SAVAGES OR RUSTIC LOUITS?

Nowadays there is little material difference between rural society and urban society except the feeling that there is something different about rural life. This feeling arises, firstly, from what might be called the amplification of systematic features of social structure, features which are muted in the urban

Incomers and Locals

setting and, secondly, because in the construction of national identities the rural landscape and its inhabitants are resorted to as a treasury of images. Several studies have explored how in the discourse of the dominant and metropolitan culture, subordinate and marginal cultures are despised and yet simultaneously enter into the construction of the identity of the dominant culture (eg Said 1978; Stalybrass and White 1986; Herzfeld 1987). These asymmetrical structures are such as to give rise to a persisting ambivalence in the meaning of the term 'local' or 'native' as it is used by those who do not consider themselves to be either native or local. Those who identify themselves as local, or indigenous, are presented with perplexing problems of rejecting parts or all of these imposed constructions while at the same time recognising the historical reality of the social relationships which generate them. The rest of this article will examine how the vocabulary of locals and incomers in a rural setting is informed by such systematic relationships of inequality of very general occurrence.

In Scotland the dimensions of meaning involved in the use of terms such as 'local' and 'incomer' are a function of the inescapable experience of asymmetries in social relationships. The relationship between local and incomer borrows from the richly ambiguous and asymmetrical national (or inter-national) relationship between Scotland and England, or Scotland and Britain. It is debatable whether, on the one hand, the phrase 'white settlers', which is heard as often as 'incomers', borrows from the image of Scotland as a colonial subordinate of England/Britain to express the meaning of the relationships at the local level between incomers and locals, where the thwarted expectations of those who 'belong' are seen as having been usurped by those who do not; or whether, on the contrary, the movement of people from England into rural areas of Scotland who then take over properties which 'ordinarily' would have been inhabited by local Scots is being used to elaborate the ideology of national subordination to England/Britain. It probably works both ways. The use of the expression 'white settlers' to describe usurping incomers is also an ironic but pointed self-reference by those who deliberately identify themselves not just as 'locals' but particularly as 'black natives', all of which is part of the imaging of a Scotland whose traditions and identity are threatened by a colonial relationship to a metropolitan England, or cosmopolitan Britain, clinging to the remains of an empire. Scottish Watch articulates these feelings when it writes that 'the Scots are most likely to be found in decaying urban labour camps - our cities and industrial towns. The English are most likely to be found enjoying the good life in the country - our country' (1984, p.6).

Scottish Affairs

At another level the expression 'white settlers' resonates as a response from those who have been described as 'locals' by those who consider themselves to be cosmopolitan, and therefore non-local. While accepting the designation 'local' they reject the outsider's cosmopolitan meaning of the term which is essentially ambivalent (Nadel-Klein 1991). 'Locals' in this usage are either romantic heroes and heroines, a people of integrity, courage, loyalty, and hard work (in other words, 'noble savages'), or they are sly rustics, backward and degenerate roughs ('barbarians'). Sometimes they may even appear to be both at once, so that one may hear it said of 'locals' that they are polite and civil in one's presence, but behind one's back, while among themselves, they are treacherous and deceitful, given to drinking and fighting. Such a view is, however, basically the local as treacherous barbarian rather than as bold romantic. This ambivalence pervades the perspective and experience of the middle-class outsider and contributes to the feeling of an overt and a covert quality to the social life of a rural locality, of secrecy and talk of 'mafias', and mystery behind appearances, but it is largely a product of a particular perspective.

This view is reproduced by scholars such as Tylor who, in his influential **Primitive Culture**, first published in 1871, projected the ambivalence onto the locals, or 'natives', and then described them as 'unstable'.

So when we read descriptions of the hospitality, the gentleness, the bravery, the deep religious feeling of the North American Indians, we admit their claims to our sincere admiration; but we must not forget that they were hospitable literally to a fault, that their gentleness would pass with a flash of anger into a frenzy, that their bravery was stained with cruel and treacherous malignity, that their religion expressed itself in absurd belief and useless ceremony. (Tylor 1929:31)

Notice how it is possible to substitute 'Scottish Highlanders', 'Greek Mountain Shepherds', 'Corsican Goat-herders', 'Vosges Peasants', or any other marginalised people with which you are (un)familiar, for 'North American Indians' in this passage and still apparently make sense as a matter of fact. Tylor could not make up his mind whether what he called the 'low civilisations' of Europe, such as those of the Hebrides and Ireland, were to be accounted for by degeneration from a previously civilised state, or whether they were the 'relics of unchanged barbarism'. That it is the metropolitan duality of meanings of the term 'local' which is 'unstable' rather than the 'locals' is well exemplified by the writings of Alastair Alpin MacGregor who, after a series of hopelessly romantic books in the nineteen thirties with titles

Incomers and Locals

such as **Behold the Hebrides, Summer Days among the Western Isles**, where the inhabitants are portrayed as spiritual, other worldly figures, turned these representations up side down in **The Western Isles** (1941) with a description of Hebrideans as idle, drunken louts, which not only caused offence to the inhabitants but scandalised sections of the Scottish literary establishment (**The Scots Magazine** September 1975). Those so described, when they respond by characterising locally resident cosmopolitans as 'white settlers', deliberately call attention to, and thereby reject, these ambivalent meanings of the identity 'local' in favour of a sense which alludes to the objective inequalities of class stratification.

The claims of those describing themselves as 'locals' are premised on the notion of the natural, yet ancestral, and enduring rights of an indigenous population. For those for whom the locals are either romantic figures or examples of uncivilised humans, there can be no question of them being anything other than survivors from either a glorious past carrying with them the remnants of a once great culture, or an ancient population which has hardly yet been touched by the extension of civilisation. In this respect all these perceptions share a presumption of a kind of historical longevity and a continuity, however attenuated, of a local population, indeed a community, which supposedly stretches back into the 'mists of time'. It is largely because of this consensus that 'locals', a community with a culture, are defined and investigated historically by themselves and by others, while 'incomers', a temporary aggregate of individuals, are the objects of social and psychological surveys. The historical research accumulates more and more concrete information as local histories are piled up, and so the subject, 'locals', is substantiated and realised, while the social surveys are condemned to repeat themselves endlessly, the results of the last survey fading even before the next one comes along to replace it, and thereby in the methods, rather than the results, constituting the transient nature of the incomer population.

The romantic view of the history of the Scottish local prevails, so that it becomes a kind of orthodoxy which conceals the basic ambivalence. There are a number of factors contributing to its prevalence and elaboration. First of all, the majority of cosmopolitans who visit or dwell in rural Scotland are attracted by their experience of the scenery as romantic, and they will, naturally enough, not wish their 'view' to be spoiled by rustic louts, and so they will be more likely to people the scenery with romantic figures. The upland landscape in particular is one of majestic glens, tremendous mountains, awesome cliffs, enchanting sea lochs, magical movements of light and shade, all infused with melancholy memories and ancient legends of dark

Scottish Affairs

deeds and tragic heroism, and inhabited by a deeply spiritual people moved by the landscape to create poetry in which

Nature sees herself reflected in a magic mirror; and though many a various show passes processionally along its lustre, displaying the scenery of 'lands and seas, whatever clime the sun's bright circle warms', among them all there are none more delightful or elevating to behold than those which genius, inspired by love, has framed of the imagery, which, in all her pomp and prodigality, Heaven has pleased to shower through all seasons, on our own beautiful land (Wilson 1875).

Wilson, a poet and philosopher who also wrote under the pseudonym of 'Christopher North', was a contemporary and promoter of Horatio McCulloch, the great Romantic landscape artist of Scotland. The photographs and text of C. Baxter and J Crumley (1989) are in the same genre. This image has been, since the middle of the nineteenth century, the prevailing or 'normal' image of the uplands and, to the extent that it is now virtually a 'folk' image, is not easily attributable to particular authors, though a good case can be made for The Rev John Thomson of Duddingston, together with Wilson, and McCulloch.

For others, a minority, such an image is not only a misrepresentation but also part of the problem afflicting the uplands which, in their account, are hardly to be distinguished from industrial slag heaps, such has been the ecological devastation, degradation, and deterioration. Moreover this destruction of the ecosystem has, over time, 'a subtle interaction with the consciousness of the destroyer and it is reasonable to suggest that to inhabit a severely damaged one is spiritually debilitating, even depressing', which seems to be another way of talking about Tylor's degenerate populations (Planterose 1992, p.15). Any prospect of a deeply rewarding encounter with 'Nature' is ruled out. The formal expression of this sharply diverging view can be traced to Frank Fraser Darling's **Natural History of the Highlands and Islands** (1947), and informs the policies of the Green Party in the Highlands. But, and for obvious reasons, it is the former image which is actively cultivated by the promoters of tourism and travel, and it is sustained in its eager consumption by tourists and sojourners, not excluding the Scots themselves.

THE 'ENGLISH'

Curiously enough this process is accompanied by a resentment expressed as the 'Englishing' of Scotland. A number of factors are at work here in such a

Incomers and Locals

way as to amplify the impact of the presence of migrants from England, and the Lowlands of Scotland, even Germany and France, who in this respect are simply aggregated with 'the English', even as the 'local' culture is being recreated and promoted. There is an obvious link between the expansion of popular tourism in the sixties bringing people on holiday from England, but also from continental European countries, and the growth in facilities catering for tourists. The first of the present craft shops on Skye opened in 1950, according to the Craft Shop at Hungladder, Kilmuir. The expansion of this sector must also be considered alongside the decline in fishing and agriculture as employers. It is a short step from being a consumer of tourism looking for facilities to becoming a producer for other tourists. So guest houses, hotels, restaurants, inns, craft shops, boat charter businesses, and the like, come to be owned by people who previously used them, that is, tourists and holiday makers.

However, those involved in tourist related business, the 'incomers', are likely to concern themselves with cultivating the distinctiveness of the locality, promoting 'local scenery' and making visible 'local' craft fairs, 'local' folk festivals, and other events which will encourage trading and business. Even agricultural shows which are more likely to be of interest to 'locals' than 'incomers' will, because of their potential as an event of interest to holiday makers, come to involve 'incomers'. At the Sunart Agricultural Show in 1988 the biggest number of entries, and largest audience, for any single competition category was for the 'Dog with the Waggiest Tail'. The first four places, unsurprisingly, all went to the dogs of holiday makers, though this was not, of course, reported in **The Oban Times**, the local paper, where the headline was 'Mull man takes the honours at the Sunart show'. This was for some stirks. The dog competition was mentioned later in the report as an 'innovation' along with the traditional but 'newly formed Sunart Pipe Band' (**The Oban Times** 1988, p.2).

These are areas of high visibility for urban Scots who have experienced a degree of upward social mobility and are travelling on sentimental journeys to scenes of childhood in rural Scotland and for whom the Highlands especially are a well-spring of images from which is constructed a personal and national identity. It is rather disturbing for them, therefore, as they move from one bed and breakfast to the next, from one restaurant to another, from hotel to inn, and browse in traditional Scottish craft shops, attend local music festivals, to discover that the people they have to deal with are not only migrants from Edinburgh or Glasgow but, more often than not, from Nottingham, Leeds, even Berlin, Toulouse, Toronto, and elsewhere. On the other hand, this may be a continuation and elaboration of a tradition of

Scottish Affairs

Highland innkeeping by other means. Burt in 1730 observed that innkeepers in the then largely monoglot Gaelic-speaking Highlands invariably spoke English and were therefore useful interpreters (Burt 1818, p.312). And in **Kidnapped**, David Balfour encounters an innkeeper on Mull who not only spoke English but French and Latin as well. Such experiences may also be perplexing because emulating the middle class means coming to identify with the cosmopolitan view, and therefore confronting the possibility that what one thought to be the reality of one's past, as a 'local', is revealed through the romantic constructions of 'incomers' to be an aspect of an essentially ambivalent image. Rather than recovering their roots, they are floundering in a quicksand of uncertainty, a predicament which contributes to the prominent and continual search for identity. Who are the Gaels? What is a real Highlander?

BELONGING

The metaphorical force of the notion of local, and by implication, incomer, is also a product of the structure of feeling referred to as 'belonging'. If there are locals there must be a locality, and the sense of a rural locality, whether a discrete nucleated settlement, a village, as in England, or a named area of dispersed settlement as is more common in rural Scotland, is a necessary concomitant of the feeling of 'belonging', in so far as this is considered to be a defining attribute of personal identity. In an expression such as 'my family belongs to Applecross' there must be some more or less understood boundary to the territory identified as Applecross, and my family is defined as part of the totality which is the territory and all those who belong to it. Exactly where the boundary line might be drawn could be a contested matter in so far as the implication of such an announcement is that in some way an individual who is part of Applecross has certain expectations in Applecross which they do not have elsewhere, for example, and especially, as regards claims to residence which in practice means housing, and perhaps also employment. 'Incomers' do not belong, and are therefore not a part of the totality despite their presence in the territory. Such exclusive expectations, and the identities which are being defined metaphorically, are officially acknowledged when local authorities and official agencies attempt to define objectively the attributes of a local person for the purposes of privileged access to low-cost housing. Highland Region also include in their definition of a local person someone who has 'a strong local connection with, through family association, a specified area' (Scottish Homes 1991, p.56). In other words, the bounded nature of a locality, 'a specified area', is translated into a defining attribute of

Incomers and Locals

personal identity, and is a function of the part-whole relationship which is at the core of the structure of feeling called 'belonging'.

But the security of identity which is achieved in the appeal to locality by claiming to be a 'local' is only apparent. 'Belonging' is not simply to a portion of the surface of the earth, to an abstract address which can be expressed in terms of latitude and longitude, but to the concrete historical reality of a particular place. Though the local community may be, in some objective sense, stationary relative to the surface of the earth, the historically constituted and therefore changing meaning of the landscape is continually threatening to subvert that sense of attachment which constitutes the local community. And the embodiment of the major threat to community in this sense is perceived as the 'incomer', the stranger who, in Simmel's phrase, is not 'the wanderer who comes today and goes tomorrow, but rather...the person who comes today and stays tomorrow. He is, so to speak, the potential wanderer; although he has not moved on, he has not quite overcome the freedom of coming and going' (Simmel 1950, p.402). Yet, paradoxically, at the same time the figure of 'the stranger' in this sense is one which calls into existence a heightened awareness of community. The stranger confronts the population in such a way as to provoke both a sense of community and a sense of belonging. But this drawing of boundaries, especially in a spatial idiom, has the effect of transforming personal relationships, perceived as a network, into a bounded community, and results in highlighting some who are included but who should not be, 'strangers', and in marking the exclusion of others, childhood friends and relatives, who are living elsewhere, 'exiles' (Mewett 1982).

REMOTENESS

Such a sense of the rural locality being populated by those who belong and those who do not, incomers, is amplified by the experience of a quality of 'remoteness' which pervades certain rural regions. Edwin Ardener has pointed out that remote areas are not simply physically removed so that their remoteness is a function of geography (Ardener 1987). The experience of remoteness is phenomenologically complex. The defining attribute of a remote area is the paradox of both a sense of the difficulty of travelling to the area, and, at the same time, a sense of the vulnerability of the area to penetration by agents and agencies from elsewhere. The communities in such localities are invariably described as 'fragile', which description is intended to convey the need for intervention to sustain them, and an understanding that such intervention is likely to destroy them. The paradox is evident in the

Scottish Affairs

ambivalent feelings surrounding the building and improvement of roads to such areas (see, for example, Darling 1955, pp.322-3). And therefore alongside the image of tranquillity, peace, and an ancient way of life, is the experience of rapid change and innovation amidst the ruins of previous projects and development schemes. Ardener goes on to argue that this quality of remoteness clarifies the experience of social interaction and awareness of social structures. Claud Cockburn, when he lived in rural Ireland, had also noticed this amplifying effect which he described as 'an awareness one continually had there of what may be called the presence of the past...This crowding in of history serves to intensify a consciousness of the pressures and contradictions of life and society in the present...The point is not that they exist uniquely in Ireland but that they are muffled by nothing' (1967, pp.290-1). For instance, and of particular relevance here, the presence of strangers is notably evident in, and therefore indicative of, remote areas, so that regardless of actual numbers, assuming that some objective definition of 'stranger' could be arrived at, there would always appear to be lots of them. And the strangers are, of course, perceived as the innovating agents of change.

CONCLUSION

In this article we have drawn attention to a powerful metaphorical dimension of meaning in the paired terms 'local' and 'incomer'. These terms are not literal descriptions of a demographic reality, the folk term equivalents of the demographers' concepts. As metaphors they draw their compelling obviousness and ambivalence from the inescapable experience of the asymmetries of social class. At the same time there are several reflexive processes which amplify the experience of a duality of locals and incomers, such as those associated with the phenomenon of 'remoteness', and with the paradox of strangers both inducing and subverting the structure of feeling called 'belonging'. All of which means that objective investigations which seek to substantiate, for example, the reality of the impact of incomers are bound to fail since by definition they ignore precisely those cognitive features of the situation which constitute the reality of the relationship between locals and incomers.

REFERENCES

- Ardener, E. (1987). 'Remote areas': some theoretical considerations. **Anthropology at Home**. A. Jackson (ed). London and New York, Tavistock.

Incomers and Locals

- Ascherson, N. (1993). The warnings that Scotland's patient nationalism could turn nasty. **The Independent**, 21 November, 1993.
- Baxter, C, and J Crumley. (1989). **West Highland Landscape**. Lanark, Colin Baxter Photography Ltd.
- Board of Agriculture and Fisheries (1913). **Report on Migration from Rural Districts in England and Wales**. London, HMSO.
- Bolton, N, and B. Chalkley. (1990). The rural population turnaround; a case study of North Devon. **Journal of Rural Studies** vol 6, 29-43.
- Burt, Capt. (1818). **Letters from a gentlemen in the North of Scotland**. London, fifth edition, volume 1.
- Campbell, R. R, and D. Johnson. (1976). Propositions on counterstream migration. **Rural Sociology** vol 41, 127-145.
- Champion, A. (ed). (1989). **Counterurbanization**. London, Arnold.
- Cockburn, C. (1967). **I, Claud, an autobiography**. Harmondsworth, Penguin.
- Darling, F. F. (ed). (1955). **West Highland Survey**. London, Oxford University Press.
- Dickson, M. (1994). 'Should auld acquaintance be forgot? A comparison of the Scots and English in Scotland', **Scottish Affairs**, no.7, summer 1994, 112-134.
- Hancox, J. (1993). A quiet rising of the clans. **The Guardian**, 5 November, 1993.
- Herzfeld, M. (1987). **Anthropology through the Looking Glass: critical ethnography on the margins of Europe**. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.
- Jones, H, N. Ford, J. Caird, and W. Berry. (1984). Counterurbanization in societal context: long distance migration to the Highlands and Islands of Scotland. **Professional Geographer** vol 36, 437-444.
- MacCaig, N. (1985). **Collected Poems**. London, Chatto & Windus.
- Mewett, P. (1982). Exiles, nicknames, social identities and the production of local consciousness in a Lewis crofting community. **Belonging: identity and social organisation in British rural cultures**. A Cohen (ed). Manchester, Manchester University Press.
- Ministry of Works and Planning (1942). **Report of the Committee on Land Utilisation in Rural Areas**. London, HMSO Cmd 6378.
- Planterose, B. (1992). Reforesting Scotland: beyond conservation. **Wilderness with People: the management of wild land**. Denis Mollison (ed). Musselburgh, Midlothian, The John Muir Trust.
- Said, E. (1978). **Orientalism**. London, Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- The Scots Magazine**, September 1975.
- Scottish Homes (1990). **Rural Housing Consultation: a report on Meetings**. (Research Report No 12).

Scottish Affairs

- Scottish Homes (1991). **Planning agreements and low cost housing in Scotland's rural areas**. Consultancy exercise prepared for Scottish Homes by Baxter Clark and Paul, Chartered Architects and Town Planning Consultants.
- Scottish Office (1992). **Scottish Rural Life**. Edinburgh, Scottish Office.
- Scottish Watch (1994). **The New Scottish Clearances**.
- Stalybrass, P, and D White. (1986). **Poetics and Politics of Transgression**. London, Methuen.
- Simmel, G. (1950). **The Sociology of Georg Simmel** (trans. Kurt Wolff) Glecoe, Illinois, The Free Press.
- Tylor, E. (1929). **Primitive Culture**. London, John Murray.
- Wester Ross Life**. (1994). Editorial. Issue No 1, Spring, 1994.
- Wilson, J. (1875). Remarks on the Scenery of the Highlands. **A History of the Scottish Highlands**. J. S. Keltie (ed). Edinburgh and London, Fullarton, 1875.
- July 1994*

REVIEW: A DANCE CALLED AMERICA

David Craig

James Hunter **A Dance Called America: The Scottish Highlands, the United States and Canada**, Edinburgh: Mainstream, £14.99, hb, 1994, ISBN 1851586393, 288pp

The history of a whole people's experience as grievous, complicated, and far-flung as the Highland diaspora never ceases to be written. More details are forever surfacing, from archives in the big houses, from the words of people whose grand- or great-grandparents saw their roofs or looms eaten up by flames in Sollas or Strathnaver, or remember a torch flashing or a thatched roof burning on Lewis in a last farewell to the emigrant boats in 1923 (Wilkie 1984, pp.72-74). The lines of communication are stretched and thinned, by absence, time passing, and the wish to forget the heartbreak or the atrocity. In the end the first-hand history reduces to a core of memoirs and stories, part history and part myth. They never die out entirely, and today the events of 1800 to 1870 remain strikingly near. At Dervaig on Mull, in 1989, Mary Morrison could still tell me what her father had told her about the pouring of the fresh milk onto the fires. He had seen this with his own eyes when his family and neighbours were evicted at Boreraig in Skye in the winter of 1853 (Craig 1990, p.28).

Recently some strikingly physical remains of clearance - a village emptied by an absentee owner in 1824 - have surfaced with the felling of Commission forests at Inniemore in Argyll. Although these were not a 'discovery' as reported in **The Guardian** for July 25 and **The Herald** for August 2 - I found them myself in April 1989, acting on a tip in a book on Morvern (Gaskell 1968), and identified at least eight houses with their walled kailyards and kilns for parching corn - it is good to know that Mary Cameron's village, which she commemorated in a tremendous lament

*David Craig has written widely on Scottish literature and history. His book about the Highland diaspora, **On the Crofters' Trail**, was published by Cape in 1990.*